

Citizen's Police Review Board

1/5/2009

MINUTES

Board Members Present:

Minister William C. Muhammad
Dardinella Hippchen, Barbara Kuipers,
David Bukala, William O'Shaughnessy,
Donata Clanton, Carlos Flores

Board Members Absent:

Quintan Cooley
Ann Craig

Staff Present:

Denny Powers, Staff Liaison

Guests Present:

Jonathan Washington
Diane Washington
Fred Crawford

Chairperson William Muhammad called the meeting to order at 6:35 p.m.

Minister Muhammad asked if everyone had a chance to read the previous meeting minutes and if there were any corrections or additions. It was motioned, supported and passed to approve the minutes as presented.

Old Business

None.

New Business

Hearing of Appeal – Case. 08-11

Chairperson William C. Muhammad asked who was present in reference to the hearing. Mr. Jonathan Washington identified himself as the complainant and his daughter Diane Washington and Mr. Fred Crawford as witnesses.

Chairperson William Muhammad asked Mr. Jonathan Washington to give his statement as to what occurred in this case.

Mr. Washington stated his complaint.

Chairperson William Muhammad then asked Ms. Diane Washington to state what she had witnessed.

Ms. Washington gave a statement in which she agreed with the complainants statements.

Ms. Dollie Hippchen asked if she would state exactly what she saw in her own words rather than agreeing with Mr. Washington's statement.

Ms. Washington then gave her statement as to what she had witnessed.

Mr. Fred Crawford was then asked for his statement and gave his statement as to what he witnessed.

There were a number of questions and observations from board members.

Detective Dykman responded to a question of how officers handle assaults that occur outside of the presence of an officer. He responded to that question.

Ms. Hippchen asked if there were pictures of the assault and it was noted that no one denied that pepper spraying had taken place and that the repossession people admitted to using pepper spray.

This was followed by additional questions from board members and additional statements from the complainant and witnesses.

Several questions were asked about the police report and parts of the report were read when required.

The original complaint was also read.

There was a five minute break taken at 7:30 p.m. and the board reconvened at 7:35 p.m.

Chairperson William Muhammad noted that the board needed to focus on the original complaint and that this is what the board can address. He explained the function of the board and the limited power of the board.

There were additional comments from board members at this point.

=====

Motions:

A motion was made by Mr. David Bukala that the officers did a thorough report and submitted it to the prosecutor's office. The motion failed due to lack of support.

A motion was made by Ms. Dardinella Hippchen that the police officers failed to make an arrest when there was physical evidence that an assault had taken place and admission by witnesses and the repossession personnel that an assault had taken place. The motion failed due to lack of support.

A motion was made by Ms. Donata Clanton that the police officers failed to make an arrest when there was physical evidence that an assault had taken place and the admission of witnesses as well as the repossession personnel that Mr. Washington was pepper sprayed. The motion was supported by Ms. Dardinella Hippchen.

After a short discussion a roll-call vote was requested by Mr. Bukala with the results as follows:

Ms. Clanton	-	yes
Ms. Kuipers	-	no
Mr. Bukala	-	no
Mr. Muhammad	-	yes
Mr. Flores	-	no
Ms. Hippchen	-	yes
Mr. O'Sahughnessy	-	no

The motion failed due to lack of a majority with three yes votes and four no votes. Ms. Hippchen asked the chairperson to explain what happens from here.

Chairperson William Muhammad explained how the minutes will be distributed and also asked that a copy be provided to Mr. Washington.

Public Participation

None.

It was motioned and supported to adjourn the meeting.

The meeting was adjourned at 8:23 p.m.

The next meeting is February 2, 2009 at 6:30 p.m. in room 103 of Muskegon City Hall.

Respectfully submitted,

Denny Powers

Denny Powers, Staff Liaison to the CPRB